A Contrastive Analysis of the Arabic Translation of Some American Songs in Dubbed and Subtitled Fairy Tale Animations

Nouran Alaa El Deen Abd El Fattah Sobhy
Master Degree -Language & Translation Department
College of Languages & Communication
Arab Academy for Science, Technology & Maritime Transport - Egypt

nouran.alaa@miuegypt.edu.eg

Prof. Shaker Rizk Taky ElDin
Professor of Linguistics , English Department
Faculty of Arts- Suez University – Egypt
shaker115@yahoo.com

Dr. Rania Magdy Fawzy
Lecturer in Linguistics, Language & Translation Department
Arab Academy for Science, Tech- Egypt
raniamagdi33@hotmail.com

Abstract
Fairy tale animations are considered a very important and effective way to transfer values and ideas reflecting the producer's language and culture. Audiovisual translation is indisputably the most common form of the translation of the films for children. The objective of this study is to determine the strategies that play a significant role when subtitling and dubbing American animation songs for children in the Arab world. This study has a descriptive analytic approach. The study compares subtitled and dubbed versions of animation songs and addresses how the prosodic and phonic features are transferred into the target text with examples from songs of four animations subtitled into Modern Standard Arabic (MSA) and dubbed into the Egyptian Dialect (ED). Adopting Skopos Theory, the study explores problems of translating songs in fairly tale animations and the strategies adopted by the Arab translators in translating this genre. The research questions include: To what extent does the analyzed TT preserve the prosodic and phonic features of the ST? And what are the translation strategies used in the translated animated musical movies’ song lyrics?

Keywords: skopos theory, audiovisual translation, dubbing, subtitling, fairy tale animations.
A Contrastive Analysis of the Arabic Translation of Some American Songs in Dubbed and Subtitled Fairy Tale Animations

Introduction

Audiovisual context is considered a very influential tool to transfer ideas, values and information. Cartoons are targeting child audience. When translating fairly tale animations, a translator is faced with a significant challenge due to the target audience nature and cultural background. The audiovisual context is considered polysemiotic as different semiotic modes are present simultaneously.

Translation of song lyrics poses an especially strong challenge in terms of retaining semantic closeness: according to Franzon, “a song translation that strives to be semantically accurate can hardly be sung to the music written for the original lyrics, and a song translation that follows the original music must sacrifice optimal verbal fidelity” (Franzon, 2005, p. 377).

Several studies of song translations have focused on the ways songs can actually be translated (Franzon, 2005 ; Low, 2008). Franzon (2005) identifies three properties of music – a melody, a harmonic structure, and an impression of meaning, mood or action, – which are particularly essential for the musico-textual fit in song translation (Franzon, 2005, p. 390). Low (2008) examines translations of song lyrics in terms of the rhyme, sense, sing-ability, rhythm and naturalness “the pentathlon principle” (Low, 2008). The two authors demonstrated that musical features of a song play a crucial role in its translation.

Emphasis in animation songs is a function of prosodic and phonic elements rather than the “presentation of information as foregrounding or back-grounding, predictability and unpredictability” (Dickens et al., 2002, p.74). Both the prosodic and phonic elements serve as cohesive and coherent tool in animation songs.

The main objective of this study is to compare the subtitled and the dubbed versions of animation songs and to determine which strategies and procedures play a significant role in subtitling and dubbing songs for children in the Arab world. The focus of this study is on the sing-ability of Arabic translation of the animated songs. How the prosodic and phonic features are dealt with in the subtitling and dubbing of animation songs, whether the translators are able or unable to reproduce the phonic and prosodic features of the original song and to what extent the subtitled and dubbed versions of animation songs are different.
Questions of the Study
The main hypothesis of the study is that the translation strategies adopted by the Arab translator are constrained by the function and purpose of the TT. The meaning, the content, and what target texts are pointing to.
To test this hypothesis, the following research questions are formulated.
What are the problems and constraints that Arab translators face in English into Arabic subtitling and dubbing of animated songs?
To what extent are the subtitled and dubbed versions of animation songs different?
To what extent does the analyzed TT preserve the prosodic and phonic features of the SS?
What are the translation strategies used in the translated animated musical movies’ song lyrics?

Review of Literature and Theoretical Background
Franzon (2008) defines song as “a piece of music and lyrics – in which one has been adapted to the other, or both to one another – designed for a singing performance” (Franzon 2008, p. 376). Theoretically, this definition would mean that song translation is “a second version of a source song that allows the song’s essential values of music, lyrics and sung performance to be reproduced in a target language” (Franzon 2008, p. 376).

Franzon (2008) suggests that a song translator may choose to give priority to either the lyrics or the music, or to reach a compromise between the two, to achieve performability based on the assumption that “a song has three properties (music, lyrics and prospective performance) and music has three (melody, harmony and musical sense)” (Franzon, 2008). He named three aspects of music-textual fit as three layers of sing-ability: a prosodic match, a poetic match and a semantic-reflexive match (Franzon, 2008, p. 376). Considering music is such a complex system that can be challenging to translate, Low has formulated five criteria in order to satisfy the skopoi of a singable song: singability, sense, naturalness, rhythm, and rhyme (Low, 2003b, p. 92). These criteria form the basis of Low’s methodological framework, namely the “Pentathlon Principle”, where pentathlon functions as a metaphor for “juggling” or balancing the five criteria simultaneously.
Equivalence, in its simplest sense, refers to the relationship between the source text (ST) and the target text (TT) and is seen as what makes a TT a translation of a ST. Equivalence is a particular kind of adequacy, i.e. adequacy under the condition that the skopos requires that the source texts and target texts achieve the same function (Vermeer & Reiss, 2013, p. 128). Descriptive equivalence refers to the straightforward corresponding between ST and TT features, with no respect to the quality of the TT. On the other hand, Prescriptive equivalence refers to the relationship between a ST expression and the canonic TT rendering of it as required.

The most suitable theory which can be applied in song translation is Skopos theory as the aims and target culture needs are more important than the source song. Skopos theory was established by the German linguist Hans Vermeer in 1978 and it comprises the idea that translating and interpreting should primarily take into account the function of both the source and target text. Skopos is a Greek word for 'purpose'. Functionality (Skopos), is a theory which relies on reforming the source text resulting in production of a target text that in function is the same as the source text. So "knowing why a ST is to be translated and what the function of the TT will be are crucial for the translators" (Munday, 2008, p. 79). Domestication is “translating in a transparent, fluent, ‘invisible’ style in order to minimize the foreignness of the TT”(Munday, 2008, p. 144); here, the translator leaves the reader in peace and moves the ST towards him or her by making the translation as fluent as possible in the TT (Munday, 2008, p. 144).

Domestication is a process of cultural adaptation in which a certain cultural reference is replaced by another reference that is understood by the target audience. Domestication is considered as reader-centered and TT culture-oriented concept.

Foreignization, on the other hand, is seen as a strategy that excludes dominant cultural values in the target language; here, the translator leaves the writer in peace, and nudges the reader towards him or her (Munday, 2008, p. 145). Foreignization is considered as author-centered and ST culture-oriented concept. Foreignizing is writing in a completely smooth target-language leaving the reader wonder whether the text is a translation, or an original text that was written in target language. It is obvious that watching a subtitled film is a very different experience than watching a dubbed one.
When viewers are presented with a dubbed film, they can easily believe the illusion that what they are actually watching is an original domestic film (domesticating strategy i.e. ideology reflecting). Subtitles, on the other hand, allow the audience to hear the original dialogue and thus highlight the foreign identity of the source text (foreignizing strategy i.e. ideology forming). The translation of musical genres sets in the center of the wide spectrum ranging from extreme foreignization to extreme domestication.

In her thesis, Dubbing Timon & Pumbaa Cartoon into Egyptian Arabic, Al-Alami (2011) tackles the issue of translating and dubbing cartoons into Arabic using the Egyptian dialect. She argues that songs are being translated in an inaccurate way. The focus is mainly on creating a rhyming song in the TL without much consideration for faithfulness to the ST (Al-Alami, 2011, p. 53). Sometimes songs are even left without translation creating a different experience for the viewer and accentuating the foreignness of the cartoon while the rest of it is obviously too Egyptian to warrant leaving the song un-translated (Al-Alami, 2011, p. 53).

In a study comparing the micro and macro translational strategies adopted in two types of AVT, namely dubbing and fansubbing, the results indicate that the fansubbed version tends to adopt a foreignzed macro strategy with the direct or literal translation strategy as the prime micro source language (SL) strategy, while the Egyptian colloquial Arabic dubbed version tends to adopt a domesticated macro strategy with the substitution strategy as the prime micro target language (TL) strategy (Allam, 2016).

**Methods and Procedures**

English songs were taken from four animated movies produced by Walt Disney Company, and their translations were extracted from the Arabic subtitled and dubbed versions of the animations. These are ‘Beauty and the Beast (1991), ‘Aladdin (1992), ‘The Lion King (1994), and ‘Tarzan (1999). They are available on DVDs subtitled and dubbed. Comparison between the translation of both the subtitled and the dubbed version was identified.

The analysis of the research material is based on Low’s five criteria from the Pentathlon Principle: singability, sense, naturalness, rhythm and rhyme. Sense
and naturalness have been treated simultaneously since these two principles have to do with the semantic content of songs, while rhythm, rhyme have been analyzed together as prosodic and phonic elements of the translations. For sense, the translator’s micro-level decisions were analyzed by means of a taxonomy of 12 micro strategies developed by Schjoldager (2010b, p. 92). Regarding the prosodic elements of the song translations, the main concern when it comes to rhythm has been to investigate the syllables, the syllables of each translation unit have been counted to clearly illustrate if the number of syllables in the STs and the TTs coincide or not. Regarding the phonic elements of the song translations, rhyme was analyzed by counting and comparing the rhyming groups of the STs and the TTs.

The aim of paper has been to investigate to what extent and in what ways Low’s Pentathlon principle has been observed in the subtitled and dubbed Arabic versions of the animated songs within the framework of Skopos theory.

Analysis

**Song title** “You’ll be in my heart”, from *Tarzan* (1999)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Source Text:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Come stop your crying</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>It will be <em>alright</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Just take my hand</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hold it <em>tight</em></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Dubbed Version</th>
<th>Subtitled Version</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>دْٝزْب ثخٞش</td>
<td>هيا كف عن البكاء</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>دِینتْنا بخْرِ</td>
<td>ستكون الأمور على مايرام</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>هاتِ يلا إٍدیک</td>
<td>خذ بیدى</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>يلا نعیش</td>
<td>و أمسكها بقوة</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Translation Procedure:**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Dubbed Version</th>
<th>Subtitled Version</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Paraphrase</td>
<td>Direct translation</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Analysis:**

In the subtitled version, the translator used word for word translation. As for the dubbed version, the translator paraphrased “It will be alright ” into دِینتْنا بخْرِ (lit. Our life is fine). Although both clauses have similar semantic contents, the
A Contrastive Analysis of the Arabic Translation of Some American Songs in Dubbed and Subtitled Fairy Tale Animations

ST does not mention (life) at all as in dubbed TT. Addition of 

was made for no obvious reason other than to keep the rhyme between 

and create familiarity to the children watching the dubbed version.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Source Text:</th>
<th>Arabic Translation Procedure: Paraphrase</th>
<th>Arabic Translation Procedure: Direct translation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I will protect you From all around you I will be here Don't you cry</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Dutch Version</th>
<th>Subtitled Version</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>قلبي نور يحميك من الخوف و الليل أنا وياك ما تبكيش</td>
<td>سوف احميك من كل شيء حولك سأكون معك هنا فلا تبكي</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Translation Procedure: Direct translation

Analysis:

In the dubbed version, the translator used paraphrase procedure to translate “I will protect you” in the ST into

قلبي نور يحميك (lit. My heart is light protects you), while addition was used in dubbing “from all around you” into

من الخوف و الليل (lit. From fear and night).

I believe that this can be interpreted as a culture reference to be more relevant to the Arab children as it is commonly known that 

الخوف و الليل are mostly scary in the Arab culture.

Rhyme between 

ايديك / يحميك and 

أحميك / حولك
A Contrastive Analysis of the Arabic Translation of Some American Songs in Dubbed and Subtitled Fairy Tale Animations

**Song title** “Circle of life”, from *The Lion King* (1994)

**Source Text:**
From the day we arrive on the planet
And blinking, step into the sun
There’s more to see than can ever be seen
More to do than can ever be done

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Dubbed Version</th>
<th>Subtitled Version</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ده من أول نهار احنا عشانه</td>
<td>منذ أول نهار نحياه</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>الشمس دي سر الحياة</td>
<td>والشمس هي سر الحياة</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>الكون مليان بعجائب واشكال</td>
<td>والعجائب لها عديد الأشكال</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ويتزيد ع اللى ننتماه</td>
<td>وتزيد عما رجولاه</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Translation Procedure:** Paraphrase

**Analysis:**
“From the day we arrive on the planet” is subtitled into
منذ أول نهار نحياه
(lit. From the first day we lived), “And blinking, step into the sun” subtitled into
والشمس هي سر الحياة
(lit. the sun is the secret of life). The translator described the synonymous meanings, the sun confers life at the start of day on earth. This resembles the translations in the dubbed version “From the day we arrive on the planet” is dubbed into
ده من أول نهار احنا عشانه
(lit. From the first day we lived), “And blinking, step into the sun” is dubbed as
الشمس دي سر الحياة
(lit. The sun is the secret of life). The song is about appreciating life and taking in the wonders of this world. From the moment we open our eyes there are countless miracles to be witnessed in the world.

**Source Text:**
There is far too much to take in here
More to find than can ever be found
But the sun rolling high
Through the sapphire sky
Keeps great and small on the endless round
A Contrastive Analysis of the Arabic Translation of Some American Songs in Dubbed and Subtitled Fairy Tale Animations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Dubbed Version</th>
<th>Subtitled Version</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| أسرار تفوق الخيال الناس  
حوالين كل شيء تلقاه  
نور الشمس ومداه  
علي الأرض ضياء  
ترسم فلوك كلنا جواد |
| لفسير كل شيء تلقاه  
نور الشمس ومداه  
ينير الحياة  
يسبدنا كلما نراه |

**Translation Procedure: Paraphrase**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Analysis:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The translator in dubbed version maintain the rhyme between the last words of the four lines, i.e., نلقاه بدلًا من شيء، ضياء، جواد in expense of losing semantic content. “There is far too much to take in here” is subtitled into أسرار تفوق الخيال (lit. Secrets beyond imagination) and dubbed into أسرار تفوق الخيال الناس (lit. Secrets beyond people’s imagination) and “More to find than can ever be found” is subtitled into لفسير كل شيء تلقاه (lit. To explain everything we meet) and dubbed into حوالين كل شيء تلقاه (lit. About everything we meet).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

There is just too much of things to be seen or done in a lifetime on Earth. The Sun is the main source of life on Earth. The circle of life continues through each one of us, making this world come to life and death and life again forever and ever “the endless round.” dubbed as ترسم فلوك كلنا جواد (lit. Draw a sphere and all of us inside it).

**Source Text:**

It’s the circle of life  
And it moves us all  
Through despair and hope  
Through faith and love
A Contrastive Analysis of the Arabic Translation of Some American Songs in Dubbed and Subtitled Fairy Tale Animations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Dubbed Version</th>
<th>Subtitled Version</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>نحن نجد مكاننا</td>
<td>نحن نجد مكاننا</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>على الطريق الشاسع</td>
<td>على الطريق الشاسع</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>في دائرة الحياة</td>
<td>في دائرة الحياة</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>دايشهح اىحٞبح</td>
<td>دايشهح اىحٞبح</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>دايشهح أثذٝخ</td>
<td>دايشهح أثذٝخ</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>لا ّؼشف</td>
<td>لا ّؼشف</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ثحَبٕب</td>
<td>ثحَبٕب</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ّحظٚ</td>
<td>ّحظٚ</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>الحذ إلى</td>
<td>الحذ إلى</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>سابتاننا وياها</td>
<td>سابتاننا وياها</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>في رحلة ابديه</td>
<td>في رحلة ابديه</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>في الدائرة</td>
<td>في الدائرة</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>في دائرة الحياة</td>
<td>في دائرة الحياة</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Translation Procedure: Oblique
translation

Analysis:
The translator has changed the meaning of the source text. But despite this change in meaning, the original message of the lyric has been preserved in the translation. The translator had used a sense-for-sense translation procedure, explaining the meaning of the lyrics in subtitling and dubbing. The circle of life is a symbolic term for the series of events that unfolds on earth. The circle of life described as “And it moves us all”, “Through despair and hope”, “Through faith and love”, “Till we find our place” in ST and in dubbed version, the circle of life is

دٙ داٝشح أثذٝخ (lit. It is an eternal circle)
تحضنا جواها (lit. Embrace us inside it),
ووجودنا في حماها (lit. And our presence is because it protects us),
سابتاننا وياها (lit. Leads us with it).

Mufasa is the Lion King -all other animals in the savannah are under his sovereignty- and he presents his new-born son Simba to the crowds. The animals of all shapes and sizes traveling to Simba's presentation. Although they're all extremely different, these animals exist together in a peaceful and
beautiful harmony that mirrors the circle of life itself. The animals wordlessly moving towards Pride rock where Mufasa was standing. At the end of the song, sun slices through the clouds to bless baby Simba, held skyward by the monkey Rafiki, and all animals bow to him. The images support and reinforce the information provided through the ST lyrics.

Rhyme between
جوها بحماها، وياما

**Song title** “A whole new world”, from *Aladdin* (1992)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Source Text</th>
<th>Subtitled Version</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I can show you the world</td>
<td>يمكنتى ان أريك العالم</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shining, shimmering, splendid</td>
<td>يضنى ويوهمض بشكل بديع</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Dubbed Version**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>I can show you the world</strong></th>
<th><strong>هاتى ايدك</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Shining, shimmering, splendid</strong></td>
<td><strong>هشوف دينا جديده بتممع</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Translation Procedure: Paraphrase**

**Analysis:**
The phrase “I can show you the world” is dubbed into ED as **هاتى ايدك** (lit. Give me your hands). The phrase “Shining, shimmering, splendid” is dubbed into **هشوف دينا جديده بتممع** (lit. We will see a shining new world). Using paraphrase in these two lines suits the common saying of the Arabic culture and conveys the message to the Arabic children audience. The dubbed version tends to be quite domesticated with most of the micro translational strategies are target-text oriented. The dubber by adopting paraphrase, gets the foreign source text in the vicinity of the target language realm, and thus to the target audience as well. The main idea is transferred with some sense manipulation.

In subtitled version, the translator used word to word translation procedure.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Source Text</th>
<th>Subtitled Version</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Tell me princess now</td>
<td>أخبرينى باميرية</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>When did you last let your heart decide?</td>
<td>امتى قلبي كان ليكي يوم دليل ؟</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Dubbed Version**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>I can show you the world</strong></th>
<th><strong>هاتى ايدك</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Shining, shimmering, splendid</strong></td>
<td><strong>هشوف دينا جديده بتممع</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Translation Procedure: Direct translation**
A Contrastive Analysis of the Arabic Translation of Some American Songs in Dubbed and Subtitled Fairy Tale Animations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Translation Procedure: Paraphrase</th>
<th>Translation Procedure: Direct translation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Analysis:</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“Tell me, princess now” was dubbed as</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(lit. O Princess). The two words ‘Tell me’ and ‘Now’ was deleted from the dubbed version.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The phrase “When did you last let your heart decide?” was dubbed as</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>امتى قلبك كان ليكي يوم دليل؟</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(lit. At what time your heart was guiding you?)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The translator used the word دليل which means to show or indicate the way to someone, to convey the meaning of taking a decision. In subtitled version word to word procedure was used.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Source Text**
I can open your eyes
Take you wonder by wonder

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Dubbed Version</th>
<th>Subtitled Version</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>سبيى قلبك ليا</td>
<td>يمكنني أن أفتح عينيك</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ويشوف دينا عجيبة</td>
<td>أنفلق من أعجوبة إلى أخرى</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Translation Procedure: Paraphrase</th>
<th>Translation Procedure: Direct translation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Analysis:</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“I can open your eyes” is dubbed into</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>سيى قلبك ليا</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(lit. Leave our heart with me) and “Take you wonder by wonder” is dubbed into</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ويشوف دينى غريبة</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(lit. See wondrous world). Aladdin tries to fulfill Princess Jasmine’s happiness by taking her on a magic carpet ride and serenading her. The song is having imaginative theme and it is really a great portrayal of falling in love, it also parallels Princess Jasmine’s desire for freedom. In subtitled version, the translator used word to word translation procedure.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Source Text**
Over, sideways and under
### On a magic carpet ride

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Dubbed Version</th>
<th>Subtitled Version</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>دينة بعيدة وقريبة</td>
<td>من الأعلى والجانب إلى أسفل بجولة على البساط السحري نظير</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Translation Procedure: Paraphrase**

**Analysis:**
“Over, sideways and under” is paraphrased as دينة بعيدة وقريبة (lit. A far and near world) in the dubbed version. Aladdin knows that Jasmine has never been on a magic carpet ride because she has always been living in the palace. Jasmine had to experience this with Aladdin; this made their love even stronger. In subtitled version, the translator used word to word translation procedure.

**Song title** “Be our guest”, from *Beauty and the Beast* (1991)

### Source Text: Be our guest

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Dubbed Version</th>
<th>Subtitled Version</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>عشاء إش</td>
<td>كوني ضيفتنا</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Translation Strategy:** Direct translation

**Analysis:**
The phrase “Be our guest” is dubbed as عشاء إش (lit. A luxurious dinner) and subtitled literally as كوني ضيفتنا.

The Arabic dubber resorted to a total exchange of meaning, whereby the TT phrasing is entirely different from the ST phrasing. Nevertheless, there is a logical connection of meanings between the two phrasings. If we listen to the introduction in the ST, it says: “And now we invite you to relax, let us pull up a chair as the dining room proudly presents - your dinner!” This was dubbed as:
The sense was reflected, a dinner is served to a guest. In Egyptian dialect (ED) is a term used to describe something luxurious, by using this familiar Arabic term the meaning is clarified and made easier for children audience.

### Source Text:
Put our service to the test

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Dubbed Version</th>
<th>Subtitled Version</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>من طعاماتها الودن توش</td>
<td>واختبرى خدماتنا</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Translation Strategy: Direct translation

**Analysis:**
The phrase “Put our service to the test” is translated into MSA as which is a literal translation. But, it is dubbed into (lit. Tasty to cause noise in your ears) in Egyptian dialect (ED) which is completely different, but suits the common saying of the Arabic culture and conveys the message to the Arabic children audience.

### Source Text:
Tie your napkin ‘round your neck, Cherie

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Dubbed Version</th>
<th>Subtitled Version</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>حطى الفوطّة يا نطنوّة</td>
<td>اربيطي منديلك حول عنفك ياعزيزي</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Translation Strategy: Direct translation

**Analysis:**
“Tie your napkin round your neck, Cherie,” is dubbed as (lit. Put on the napkin, Kitty). The translation was word for word translation in subtitling. اربيطي منديلك حول عنفك ياعزيزي The word نطنوّة is used in ED when talking to a lovely little girl. This local referent replaces the
word “Cherie” in the dubbing. Moreover, “napkin” is dubbed to the ED equivalent

The meaning is easily determined from the context.

Source Text:
And we’ll provide the rest

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Dubbed Version</th>
<th>Subtitled Version</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>على ما اللحمه الزيده تطش</td>
<td>ونحن سوف ننكمل بالبقى</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Translation Strategy: Addition

Analysis:

“And we provide the rest” is dubbed as
على ما اللحمه الزيده تطش

(lit. As the butter sizzles over the meat)

One reason for using addition in the translation of these lines may be attributed to phonic matters. The translator has made rhyme between the last words of the three lines, i.e.,

إش / توش / تطش

in expense of losing semantic content.

“Put our service to the test” is dubbed as
من طعامتها الودن توش

In the source song, the kitchen tools want Belly to test their service, cooking, food preparation, singing, and dancing. They didn’t mention an opinion regarding the food, but in the dubbed version, a comment on the taste is added. The translator did that to keep the rhyme of the song. Preserving rhyme is a priority in animation songs dubbing. “And we provide the rest” is dubbed as

على ما اللحمه الزيده تطش

The English phrase means that Belly has to prepare herself only and everything will be served to her table; she has to wait for a while for the food to served hot. The same sense is reflected in the dubbed version with one small addition. It describes the kind of food that is being cooked while maintaining the rhyme in the song.

توش / تطش

Sense
In translation, the transfer of sense is one of the main priorities. However, in the case of song translation the concept of sense transfer has to be more flexible than in other types of translation. As Franzon (2008) explains: “A song translation that strives to be semantically accurate can hardly be sung to the music written for the original lyrics, and a song translation that follows the original music must sacrifice optimal verbal fidelity” (Franzon, 2008, p. 376).

Regarding the transfer of sense, the subtitles tend to reflect it accurately. Direct translation is the most common strategy found in the subtitles analyzed. The subtitled version reveals that it tends to be quite foreignized. With most of the micro translational strategies are source-text oriented, the subtitler gets the target audience as close and familiar as possible to the source text by adopting direct and word for word translation.

The analysis of the dubbed version demonstrates that this version tends to be quite domesticated. With most of the micro translational strategies are target-text oriented, the dubber by adopting paraphrase, gets the foreign source text in the vicinity of the target language realm, and thus to the target audience as well. In dubbing songs, direct linguistic transfer as such is unusual.

However, the main idea tends to be transferred in the dubbed songs, although there are some cases of sense manipulation. Considering the Skopos of subtitles, these findings indicate that sense has been of high priority in subtitling since the translators have made subtitled lyrics similar semantically to their source lyrics.

Rhythm
This is one of the most important elements in song translation. The analysis of rhythm has observed if the number of sung syllables in the source lyrics coincides with the number of sung syllables in the subtitled and dubbed songs, as well as observing if the musical stress falls on the same notes. The prosodic elements would be sacrificed in subtitling and prioritized in dubbed translations.

The dubbed lyrics are hence singable as expected based on the skopos of singable song translations. It is important that the rhythm is preserved. In order to preserve rhythm, other elements may be sacrificed as the linguistic content.
The analysis shows that the dubbed lyrics are more similar to their source lyrics when it comes to number of syllables than the subtitled lyrics.

There is no identical pattern of sentence stress even if there is similar number of syllables between the subtitled lyrics and source song lyrics. These subtitled TTs don’t follow the melody of their STs, and that they therefore are difficult to sing along with. This indicates that rhythm has not been the top priority for the subtitlers while it has been of high priority for the translators of the dubbed lyrics.

Rhythm seems to be one of the main priorities in singable song translation. Most of the dubbed songs reproduce the original rhythmic pattern, the slight distortions observed tend to be related to introducing more syllables in the translated songs. The subtitles analyzed are not meant to be singable, thus they do not attempt to preserve the source song rhythm.

**Rhyme**

The dubbed lyrics have a larger proportion of coincident rhyming lines with the source song lyrics than the subtitled lyrics. The focus is mainly on creating a rhyming song in the dubbed version without much consideration for faithfulness to the source song. The subtitles songs are not designed to be sung.

The general approach towards rhyme observed in the Arabic subtitles is not to maintain it. This decision makes the translating activity less constrained. The analysis reveals that rhyme is not taken into account in the subtitles. The translator does not endeavour to maintain the rhyming patterns in the Arabic subtitles. Therefore, the rhythm, poetic and musical features are lost in Arabic subtitles and the target audience would not experience the same influence as that of the source audience.

Although rhyme is taken into consideration in the dubbed songs, the original rhyme-pattern does not tend to be reproduced. In this sense, it seems that preserving the SS rhyme-pattern is not one of the main priorities when dubbing or subtitling the songs analyzed. The analysis shows that whilst rhyme is present in the dubbed songs analyzed, the rhyme-scheme is generally not preserved.
Most of the translation units of the dubbed songs analyzed show partial preservation of the rhyme-scheme of the source lyrics and add more rhyming lines in the translation. Some translation units do not mirror the rhyming pattern of the original song. The units that replicate exactly the rhyme-scheme of the source song are less. The dubbed lyrics have more rhyming groups than the subtitled lyrics. This was expected since singable song translators often put a lot of emphasis on rhyme and at the same time rhymes are not important in subtitling considering the audience is only able to read one caption at a time. The MSA subtitled and ED dubbed TTs differ when it comes to prosodic and poetic features. The dubbed TTs are hence singable as expected based on the skopos of singable song translations. While the translators of the subtitled TTs have prioritized sense, the prosodic principles of rhythm and rhyme have been the main concern for the translators of the dubbed TTs. The prosodic elements have thus to a greater extent been sacrificed in the subtitled TTs, while sense has been sacrificed in the dubbed TTs.

Culture-specific items (CSIs) is one of problematic issues in translation, as being specific and limited to a certain culture and pertinently to a certain language. Cultural transplantation is the most common strategy used for translation of CSIs in dubbed version. In subtitled version most of CSIs are translated literally. The metaphor “He is not whole without a soul to wait upon” is a verse from the song “Be our Guest”. The kitchen tools are actually the servants of the prince. These servants were turned into kitchen tools by the witch in the animation film. There is personification in this metaphor using some of humans’ attributes, such as, waiting and the pronoun he to refer to one of the kitchen tools. There are emotional connotations of the word “soul” and the use of the verb “wait” instead of serve in comparing a master to a soul “without a soul to wait upon”.

This implies the kind of the relationship between the master and his servants, the servants (the tools) feel happy serving their master, they wait for this moment to come. This metaphor translates as

مَشْ مَوْجُودٌ مِنْ غَيْرِ مَا سُيَّدٌ يَنْتُوا عَلَى

The sense that the servants are not forced to serve is lost in using the imperative verb

هَات
A Contrastive Analysis of the Arabic Translation of Some American Songs in Dubbed and Subtitled Fairy Tale Animations

(lit. Give) and this sense was compensated by

مش موجود

(lit. Not present)

This implies that if the tools are not serving, they do not exist. The emotional connotations of the word “soul” are not reflected by the word

سيد

(lit. Master) but literal translation of “soul” is not appropriate, so the gain in Arabic version aimed to be more clear for the young audience who may be puzzled by the word “soul”. In the translation of this metaphor, dynamic equivalent is used to create an equivalent effect on the target audience.

Conclusion

The purpose of this study is to examine how the songs that belong to the Disney fairy tale animations are translated into Arabic. This thesis has explored how these songs are subtitled and dubbed into MSA and ED and has observed the differences between subtitled and dubbed lyrics. The aim of this paper has been to investigate to what extent and in what ways Low’s Pentathlon Principle has been observed in the subtitled and dubbed Arabic versions of the songs.

Regarding the transfer of sense, the subtitles tend to reflect it accurately. Direct translation is present in the majority of the subtitled segments analyzed. It is concluded that the tendency of the translators of the subtitled version was more towards a source-text oriented translation. This indicates that the subtitler resorts to the safest translational haven.

Paraphrase is present in the majority of the dubbed segments analyzed. It is concluded that the tendency of the translators of the dubbed version was more towards a target-text oriented translation.

This points out that the dubber manipulates the translational techniques so as to render the dubbed version quite adequate and acceptable to the target recipient. In dubbed lyrics, meaning was sacrificed so as to have the best possible rhythmic and rhymed forms, while in subtitled lyrics, the rhythmic and singable forms were sacrificed so as to have the most correct rendering of meaning. This study has shown that it is essential to assess the impact of non-linguistic elements when analyzing the translation of songs in audiovisual contents - not only in dubbing, but also in subtitling.
Limitation & Recommendation

Studies undertaken in AVT in the Arab world are scarce, compared to studies on written translation. Thus, the study will hopefully, pave the way for future research in this particular area. The data of the study is limited to two translated versions of six songs only. This does not allow for forming reliable generalizations. However, the analysis and results might provide general considerations that form the basis for future research conducted specifically on audiovisual contents. Data collection has been restricted by the limited number of professionally-subtitled and dubbed animated movies. As this particular study highlights the difference between MSA subtitled and ED dubbed version in song translation, it has to be further investigated which varieties of Arabic language are more dominant in dubbing and subtitling and what extent they may influence the process of song translation.

References:

  https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/abs/10.1080/0907676X.2003.9961466

  https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/abs/10.1080/13670050802364437


تحليل تقابل للترجمة العربية لبعض الأغاني الأمريكية المدبلجة والمترجمة
من الحكايات الخيالية في أفلام الرسوم المتحركة
نوران علاء الدين عبد الفتاح صبحي
باحثة مجستيرم. قسم اللغة والترجمة
كلية اللغة والآداب، الأكاديمية العربية للعلوم والتقنية، الننقل البحري، مصر
nouran.alaa@miuegypt.edu.eg

كلياً اللغة والأدب، جامعة السويس، مصر
shaker115@yahoo.com

نوران ماجدي فوزى
مدرسة اللغويات
كلية اللغة والأدب، الأكاديمية العربية للعلوم والتقنية، الننقل البحري، مصر
raniamagdi33@hotmail.com

الاستاذ الدكتور شاكر رزق تقى الدين
أساتذة اللغويات
كلية الآداب، جامعة السويس، مصر

المستخلص:
تعتبر أفلام الرسوم المتحركة الخيالية وسيلة فعالة، وفي غاية الأهمية لنقل القيم والأفكار التي تعكس لغة منتج العمل وثقافته. إن الترجمة السمعية والبصرية هي بالتأكيد أكثر أشكال ترجمة أفلام الأطفال شيوعًا. تهدف هذه الدراسة هو تحديد الاستراتيجيات التي تلعب دورًا مهمًا عند الترجمة المرني، ودبلجة أغاني الرسوم المتحركة الأمريكية للأطفال في العالم العربي. الغرض من هذه الدراسة هو تقديم تحليل وصفي لمنطقة ترجمة الأغاني من اللغة الإنجليزية إلى العربية، إذ تقارن الدراسة بين الإصدارات المترجمة مرنيًا والدبلجة لأغاني الرسوم المتحركة وتتناول كيفية ترجمة النصوص الصوتية والعينية إلى النص المستهدف بأمثلة من أغاني الرسوم المتحركة لأربعة أفلام مترجمة مرنيًا بترجمة أفلام مترجمة مرنيًا إلى اللغة العربية (الفصحي الحديثة) (MSA) (اللغة المصرية) (ED) (واعتمادًا على نظرية سكوبس). توضح الدراسة مشاكل ترجمة الأغاني في أفلام الرسوم المتحركة للقصص الخيالية والاستراتيجيات التي يتمكنها المترجمون العرب من ترجمة هذا النوع، وخلصت الدراسة إلى أن اتجاه الترجمة المترجمة مرنيًا كان نحو الترجمة المشتركة للنص المصدر بشكل أكبر، في حين أن ترجمة النسخة المدبلجة يتجهون أكثر نحو الترجمة المشتركة للنص المستهدف. وفي الكلمات الدبلجة، تم التخلص عن المعنى للحصول على أفضل أشكال إيقاعية ومقاسية ممكنة، بينما في الكلمات المترجمة مرنيًا، تم التخلص عن الأشكال الإيقاعية والفنية من أجل الحصول على المعنى الصحيح. وتتمثل أسلوب البحث ما يلي: إلى أي مدى يحافظ النص المستهدف المخلص على النص الصوتي والعيني للنص المصدر؟ وما هي الاستراتيجيات المستخدمة في ترجمة كلمات أغاني أفلام الرسوم المتحركة؟

الكلمات الدالة: نظرية سكوبس،الترجمة السمعية البصرية، الدبلجة، الترجمة المرنيية،
الحكايات الخيالية في أفلام الرسوم المتحركة.